The Society of Architectural Historians Missouri Valley Chapter

Volume XI

Number 2

Summer 2005



The spring of 2004 saw the demolition of the 1871 James Elms House at 2520 McLaren Avenue in Jennings, the last surviving building of at least 33 known to have been designed by Charles B. Clarke. Once an imposing country house with two contrasting tower and an irregular, picturesque massing, the house had been vacant for many years and, although restoration was studied, the projected cost proved to be more than could reasonably be justified as an investment, even with the state and federal tax credits.



J. O. Pierce Residence, "Cracker Castle," St. Louis, from Hagen, *This Is Our Saint Louis*, 1970, p. 198.

Charles B. Clarke attracted attention in the late 1860s with the design of the Pierce House, better known as "Cracker Castle," and from then on he was one of the most conspicuous and controversial architects in St. Louis. Even after he turned his attention to carriage manufacture in 1881, he continued to produce occasional designs, culminating in the Fagin Building of 1888, about which David J. Simmons wrote in the Win-



ter 1998 Newsletter. His varied practice included residences, churches, public schools, courthouses, institutional and commercial buildings, and their unusual character resulted in a comparatively large number of contemporary illustrations, which are now the only visual evidence of his work.

The two known biographical references to Clarke that were published in his lifetime conflict on several points, notably his place of birth. According to *Pen & Sunlight Sketches*, published in 1898, he was born in Rhode Island, but Richard J. Compton's *Pictorial St. Louis* of 1875 says "He was born in Norwich, Connecticut, April 6, 1836; his parents, however, are Rhode Islanders and reside in that State at the present time."¹ According to Compton, Clarke studied architecture in both Albany and New York City before coming to St. Louis in 1859.

The earliest of Clarke's datable buildings is the German Baptist Church at 14th & Carr, near Carr Square, built in 1863.² It was relatively plain. His style soon became much more elaborate and fanciful, culminating in his 1868 house at Chouteau & St. Ange for J. O. Pierce, a mansard-roofed Italian villa on a grand scale, with not one but two contrasting asymmetrically placed towers topped by steep roofs lifted above arched cornices.³ Pierce's fortune derived from provisioning the Union army with hardtack during the Civil War, and his house came to be known as "Cracker Castle," a paradigm of the excesses of the Reconstruction era. Whether its appearance was bad taste compounded by incompetence or, on the contrary, knowing and exuberant originality depended on one's point of view. John Albury Bryan, writing in 1928, wondered "how any architect could have designed a building so ugly; but if those critics have the right idea who contend that an architect should make his buildings reflect the fads of the era in which they are born, then C. B. Clarke succeeded admirably in his design of the Pierce residence, for where could there be found a better background for a generation of women who wore bustles and men who wore Prince Albert coats and stove-pipe hats?"⁴

A more sympathetic view of Clarke has been held by more recent writers, including Osmund Overby and Lawrence Lowic, who have seen a parallel between Clarke and Frank Furness (1839-1912), the Philadelphia architect who was also an often misunderstood iconoclast.⁵ Another worthy comparison is the British contemporary S. S. Teulon (1812-1873), about whose work critical opinion has ranged from "the ugliest of the High Victorian Period" to "ruthless, insensitive and original" to "interesting, even attractive."⁶



R. T. Prewitt Residence, Columbia, MO, from *Inland Monthly*, July 1972.

Whatever criticism Cracker Castle may have garnered when it was new, it marked the opening of a decadelong period of conspicuous architectural activity for Clarke. He is said to have designed "a large number of private residences," but only three seem to have been published, all in 1872 in a new journal called the *Inland Monthly*.⁷ All three had deep, irregular plans, bracketed cornices, and conspicuous porches. The Prewitt residence in Columbia, Missouri, also featured arched



Webster School, Collinsville, IL, from *The Collinsville Argus*

cornices above some second-floor windows.

The record supports Clarke's claim that "his attention has chiefly been turned to designing and superintending public buildings," and many of these incorporated asymmetrical towers and arched cornices. In his public schools, which were the most numerous of his building types, the second tower was often merely a large flue with an ornamental cap. The Collinsville, Illinois, School, later called the Webster School, was built in 1871-72 with a tall entrance spire that



Central School, Pierce City, MO, from Brown, *Pierce City Centennial*, 1970.

was soon blown down in a storm. A much simplified version of this school design was built by the Lebanon, Illinois, school district in 1874, and both have been illustrated here previously.⁸ Related school designs were built in Pierce City (located in Lawrence County, Missouri, between Springfield and Joplin) in 1872 and in Chillicothe, Livingston County, Missouri in 1875.⁹ The Chillicothe school had two large towers plus the typical small one, as did the Cote Brilliante School of 1871, when that district was still located outside the city limits of St. Louis. This design, unlike the other public schools, has the primary tower on the left corner, with the secondary one on the right corner but at a forty-five degree angle.¹⁰ The angled tower is also seen



Cote Brilliante School, St. Louis, from *Inland Monthly*, June 1872, p. 15.

at the Elms House.

Clarke built a large addition to Stephens College in Columbia, Missouri, in 1870. It had a large two-bay corner tower with a bell-shaped mansard, topped by a pyramidal cupola.¹¹ Clarke also designed the original building of the Normal School at Cape Girardeau, now Southeast Missouri State Uni-



State Normal School, Cape Girardeau, MO, from History of Boone County, 1882, p. 67.

versity. This long building, built in 1873 and burned in 1902, had its primary entrance under a tall mansarded tower centered on the short end of the building, with two smaller contrasting towers on each flank and a long chapel-like extension to the rear.¹² Other institutional buildings for which no illustrations have been located include St. Luke's Hospital in St. Louis, which was located at 913 Pine from 1870 to 1881; the Howe Literary Institute in East St. Louis, Illinois; and the State Deaf & Dumb Asylum in Fulton, Missouri, both from 1873.13



Clarke's courthouse designs followed his school models. The 1877 Newton County Courthouse in Neosho had an enormous two-tiered mansard perched on top of its entry tower, with shorter mansarded towers on the sides. Cornices extended out a 45-degree angles above corner buttresses, and windows were Romanesque. At Huntsville in Randolph County, voters rejected a proposed new courthouse in 1876, so Clarke remodeled the existing Italianate courthouse, originally built in 1858 by contractor Henry Austin. For \$10,000 he built two large contrasting towers, one with a bulbous mansard, over the end bays of the front facade and extended the building back to two rear minarets. One of the



shortestlived of Clarke's designs, the building was destroyed by fire on August 12, 1882.14

Clarke's early design for the German **Baptist** Church led to other church commissions, rang-

Newton County Courthouse, Neosho, after tower removal c. 1920, from Ohman, Encyclopedia of Missouri Courthouses, 1981.

ing from small chapels to rather substantial buildings. In the former category were the chapel of 1873 for Mt. Sinai Jewish Cemetery, the board-and-batten Union Chapel of c. 1875, later Cote Brilliante Presbyterian Church at Labadie & Marcus, and the brick Mount Calvary Episcopal Church of 1871-72 on the west side of



Randolph County Courthouse, Huntsville, MO, after 1877 remodeling, from Ohman, Missouri's Counties, County Seats, and Courthouse Squares, 1983, p. 94.

facing Lafayette.¹⁵ Calvary seated about 150 people. Both Mount Calvary and Union derived their front gables and cruciform plans from such early Gothic Revival models as those of Richard Upjohn,



but distinguished by Clarke's flair.¹⁶ Union Chapel had a bell arch perched above the main entry. while Mount Calvary had sharp finials above the transept gables as well as in front, where the narthex stood to one side with its own gable. When the Mount Calvary parish decided to move to a more populous part of St. Louis, one pa-

Union Chapel, later Cote Brilliante Church, St. Louis, from Stiritz, St. Louis: Historic Churches and Synagogues, 1995, p. 63.

rishioner later recalled that the new building was much bigger but "not near so pretty as the first church."¹⁷

Among Clarke's larger churches, the Third Baptist Church was erected at the southeast corner of 14th and Clark in 1865-66. It was round-arched and had light stone voussoirs, quoins and many string courses creating a lively pattern against the dark brick body. Nonmatching towers flanked the west-facing entrance, the south tower topped by four gables forming a bishop's mitre steeple. The interior focused on a large arch filled with organ pipes.¹⁸ The 1877 First Baptist Church of



Mount Calvary Episcopal Church, St. Louis,

from The Church News, May 1871, courtesy Sue

Leavenworth, Kansas was a simpler version of Third, substituting lancet for round arches. The brick corbel table that ran around the body of the Leavenworth church cued the much larger corbel friezes that



stages of the corner tower.19 The Leavenworth City Directory for 1868 included a glowing tribute to the quality of the building, noting that the tower was 90 feet tall and the

Third Baptist Church, St. Louis, 1867, from Payne, What Mean These Stones? (1934), p. 49.

interior 65 feet high: "This denomination has erected, on the corner of Sixth and Seneca, a temple of worship, which, for architectural proportions, size, substantialness and beauty of design and finish, both inside and out, is not surpassed West of the Mississippi; in fact there are but very few church edifices in the United States, that, to



our thinking, possesses, in such a marked degree, everything necessary to foster and stimulate religion, and be the pride, not only of the denomination that erected it, but of the city that contains it."

The Leavenworth author was equally unstinting in his praise for C. B. Clarke: "To his genius is due, in no small degree, the credit of stimulating a taste for the beautiful in our dwellings and public build-

First Baptist Church, Leavenworth, KS, courtesy Leavenworth Public Library.

ings."²⁰ Not everyone agreed with these sentiments, however. One group from the school board of Lebanon, Illinois, reported in 1874 that "reports from several buildings of his designing and superintending were so adverse to his capacity & as an architect and superintendent for school buildings, the board . . . told Mr. Clark[e] that we would not accept his plan and specifications, nor any

Rehkopf.

other of his making."²¹ It was presumably sentiments such as these that persuaded Clarke to turn his attentions in 1881 to the carriage building trade. By 1898, his factory occupied a large three-story building at 2021 Pine and employed 25 skilled workmen. They made "all kinds of carriages, buggies, surreys, phaetons, victories, sulkies, express wagons, etc." according to *Pen & Sunlight Sketches*.



Clarke did not give up the practice of architecture completely in these later years, however. The American Architect reported a dwelling for Dr. E. Chase in 1883 and four adjacent dwellings for F. Tentrap the following year, while Inland Architect reported a warehouse in 1885. A masonic hall and opera house for Chester Illinois was noted by the Republi*can* in 1888.²² Nothing more is known about

Fagin Building, St. Louis, 1888, from Yeakle, *The City of St. Louis Today*, 1889.

these buildings, but Clarke's last one, built for his father-in-law Aaron Fagin, made quite an impact. Located on Olive between 8th and 9th, the Fagin Building was a ten-story office block, five bays wide and topped by a large ornamental gable, which was bracketed out from the building on heavy stone corbels such that it appeared likely to tumble into the street. The building suffered the ignominy of being featured in Architectural Record's series, "Architectural Aberrations": "Up to date, and so far as we know, the Fagin building is the most discreditable piece of architecture in the United States. This has all the vices and crudities that we call 'western', though in fact the geography has nothing to do with them."²³ The thing that most upset the magazine was the way the Fagin Building violated classical rules of construction, but that is precisely what is most appealing about it today. Between its menacing piers of rock-faced granite, incorporating bits of columns and capitals, the Fagin Building was almost all glass, wide

oriels composed of large fixed panes flanked by narrower double-hung windows. Lawrence Lowic, writing in 1982, saw the Fagin Building as "a representative image of an older St. Louis and the individualism which helped to build it into a great city. . . it could be regarded with sympathy, tolerance, even delight."²⁴

Whatever its virtues, the Fagin Building was financially unsuccessful and marked the end of Clarke's career as an architect. He died on January 4, 1899 and is buried in Bellefontaine Cemetery.

NOTES

1. Richard J. Compton, ed., *Pictorial St. Louis, the great metropolis of the Mississippi Valley: a topographical survey drawn in perspective A.D. 1875, by Camille N. Dry* (St. Louis: Compton & Co., 1876; hereafter "Compton & Dry"), p. 183; *Pen & Sunlight Sketches of St. Louis, the Commercial Gateway to the South* (Chicago: Phoenix Publishing, 1898), p. 162.

2. Compton & Dry, Plate 43, #28. The First German Baptist Church was founded in 1850 by Second Baptist Church. It moved from its 1863 building in 1889 to 2629 Rauschenbach Avenue, where it became St. Louis Place Baptist Church.

3. Compton & Dry, Plate 40, #24; John Albury Bryan, *Missouri's Contribution to American Architecture* (St. Louis: St. Louis Architectural Club, 1928), p. 58; Lawrence Lowic, *The Architectural Heritage of St. Louis 1803-1891* (St. Louis: Washington University Gallery of Art, 1982), pp. 125-126.

4. Bryan, p. 51.

5. Lowic, p. 126; Carolyn Hewes Toft & Osmund Overby, *The Saint Louis Old Post* Office (St. Louis: Landmarks Association of St. Louis, Inc., 1979), pp. 21 & 37. Attitudes toward Furness's life and work may be sensed in the title of the forthcoming biography by Michael J. Lewis, *Frank Furness: Architecture and the Violent Mind* (New York: Norton, 2001). Other important works on Furness include James F. O'Gorman, *The Architecture of Frank Furness* (Philadelphia: Philadelphia Museum of Art, 1973, republished 1987) and George E. Thomas, Michael J. Lewis, Jeffrey A. Cohen, *Frank Furness: The Complete Works* (New York: Princeton Architectural Press, 1991).

6. Nikolaus Pevsner, *Nottinghamshire* (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1951), p. 35; C. M. Smart, Jr., *Muscular Churches: Ecclesiastical Architecture of the High Victorian Period* (University of Arkansas Press, 1989), pp. 266-267. See also Mark Girouard, "Acrobatic Gothic," *Country Life*, December 31, 1970), p. 1282.

7. Two were in Columbia, Missouri: the R. T. Prewitt residence, *Inland Monthly*, Vol. I (July 1872); and the John L. Bass residence, *Inland Monthly*, Vol. 2, No. 1 (September 1872), p. 381. The C. M. Newcomb residence was in McRee City, now part of St. Louis: *Inland Monthly*, Vol. 2, No. 1 (September 1872), p. 364. Two other houses, for Crane and Goldstein, are mentioned in Compton & Dry but are untraced.

8. The Collinsville Herald, "How Architecture Changes!", August

28, 1953; Dona Monroe, "Charles B. Clarke and the Lebanon Public School," *Missouri Valley Chapter, Society of Architectural Historians, Newsletter*, Vol. VI, No. 3 (Fall 2000), pp. 2 & 3; courtesy Floyd Sperino, curator, Collinsville Historical Museum and Harry Church, president Lebanon Historical Society. Other Illinois schools included Coulterville (Compton & Dry, p. 183) and Otterville (*St. Louis Globe*, July 8, 1873, p. 2).

9. Miriam Keast Brown, *Pierce City Centennial* (1970), p. 120; Bryan, p. 63.

10. *Inland Monthly*, Vol. 1 (June 1872), p. 15, collected by the State Historical Society of Missouri, Columbia; Compton & Dry, Plate 105, #16; *Republican*, May 25, 1871, p. 3.

11. John C. Creighton, *A History of Columbia and Boone County* (Columbia, Mo.: Computer Color-Graphics, 1987), p. 129.

12. History of Boone County, Missouri (St. Louis: Western Historical Co., 1882), p. 67; Biography of Historic Cape Girardeau County (Cape Girardeau: Bicentennial Commission, 1976), p. 45.

13. St. Luke's Hospital is named in Compton & Dry, p. 183, as is the State Deaf & Dumb Asylum, which was also reported in the *Republican*, April 21, 1873, p. 8. The Howe Literary Institute was reported in the *Republican* August 8, 1873, page 8.

14. Marian M. Ohman, Encyclopedia of Missouri Courthouses (Columbia, Mo.: University of Missouri-Columbia Extension Division, 1981), unpaged; Ohman, A History of Missouri's Counties, County Seats, and Courthouse Squares (Columbia, Mo.: University of Missouri-Columbia Extension Division, 1983, pp. 51, 53, 94-95.

15. The cemetery chapel was reported by the *Republican*, April 13, 1873, p. 11. The cemetery, at 8430 Gravois Road, St. Louis County, is now called New Mount Sinai; the chapel was replaced in 1905 by Will Levy. Calvary Church was built on land given by Henry Shaw, and his sister Mrs. Morissey was a member. The parish moved east to Jefferson & Lafayette as early as 1878. The building continued in use as a chapel for the adjacent Episcopal Orphans Home but was torn down eventually when Lafayette was extended. *The Church News*, Vol. 2, No. 5 (May 1871, with illus-tration); *Republican*, February 17, 1871, p. 2; Compton & Dry, Plate 67, #6. The Union Chapel was replaced by a brick building in 1894; Mary Margaret Stiritz, *St. Louis: Churches & Synagogues* (St. Louis: Landmarks Association, 1995), p. 63; Compton & Dry, Plate 105, #12.

16. Good discussions of the development of these churches are Phoebe B. Stanton, *The Gothic Revival and American Church Architecture* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins Press, 1968) and William J. Pierson Jr., *American Buildings and Their Architects: Technology and the Picturesque* (Garden City, New York: Doubleday & Company, 1978), especially Chapter IV, Part III, pp. 173-205.

17. M. F. Reed, "Reminiscences of an Early Missouri Rectorship," *The Church News*, June-July 1923, pp. 4-5, courtesy Sue Rehkopf, St. Louis Diocese.

18. A. W. Payne, *What Mean These Stones?* (St. Louis: author, 1934), pp. 48-49.

19. *Leavenworth Times*, "First Baptist Church: 125 Years," September 2, 1983.

20. *Leavenworth, Kansas City Directory*, 1868, pp. 12-14, courtesy Wanda C. Holder, Leavenworth County Historical Society & Museum.

21. Dona Monroe, p. 2.

22. American Architect, Vol. 14, No. 409 (October 29, 1983), p. 204 and Vol. 16, No. 450 (August 9, 1884), p. 72; Inland Architect, Vol. 5, No. 2 (March, 1985), p. 30; Republican, April 8, 1888, p. 9.

23. Architectural Record, April –June 1893, quoted by Toft & Overby, p. 21. The building was reported by *Inland Architect* Vol. 11, No. 3 (March 1888), p. xiv. It has recently been discussed by David J. Simmons, "Three Victorian Architecural Aberrations," *NewsLetter of the Missouri Valley Chapter, Society of Architectural Historians*, Vol. IV, No. 4 (Winter 1998), pp. 3-4.

24. Lowic, p. 141.

The next NewsLetter will include a list of Clarke's known works, arranged by location.

Events Calendar

Talk: "Ancient History of West St. Louis County"

Grand Glaize Branch, St. Louis County Library 1010 Meramec Station Road, near Manchester Tuesday, June 21, 7 p.m.

Mark Leach, a trustee-of the Missouri Archaeological Society and commissioner of the Chesterfield Landmarks Preservation Commission, will speak about the prehistoric residents of St. Louis County. Using several local ancient sites as a backdrop, the talk will focus on how increased efficiency led to lifestyle and cultural change over time. Participants will see a powerpoint presentation, handle ancient artifacts, and participate in question & answer.

THE POSTAL SERVICE'S HONOR ROLL OF MODERN U. S. ARCHITECTURE

The U. S. Postal Service released on May 20 a sheet (not a roll) of 37ϕ stamps entitled "Masterworks of Modern American Architecture." The twelve buildings were selected from a list of twenty provided by Paul Goldberger, architecture critic for the *New Yorker*. The honorees are these:

Frank Gehry, Walt Disney Concert Hall, Los Angeles Bruce Graham/Skidmore, Owings & Merrill, John Hancock Tower, Chicago, IL

- Philip Johnson, Glass House, New Canaan, CT
- Louis Kahn, Exeter Library, Exeter, NH

Richard Meier, High Museum of Art, Atlanta, GA

- Ludwig Mies van der Rohe, 860-880 Lake Shore Drive, Chicago, IL
- I. M. Pei, National Gallery of Art East Building, Washington, DC
- Paul Rudolph, Yale Art & Architecture Building, New Haven, CT
- Eero Saarinen, TWA Terminal, New York, NY
- William Van Alen, Chrysler Building, New York City

Robert Venturi, Venturi House, Chestnut Hill, PA

Frank Lloyd Wright, Guggenheim Museum, New York, NY

The stamps feature dramatically photographed details of strongly geometric forms, rather than views of the whole building. Perhaps that explains the inclusion of the Chrysler and the Disney, obviously too old and too young, respectively, for the rest of the group. The photos include classic shots by Margaret Bourke-White and Ezra Stoller.

Like some other new commemorative sheets, these stamps have a backing sheet that includes a brief history of each building and its architect. On the face of the stamp, however, only the building is named, not the architect, perhaps because Gehry, Meier, Pei and Venturi are still very much with us. Naming them could raise questions about commemorating a living person contrary to Postal Service rules.

Blair Kamin, architecture critic of the *Chicago Tribune*, wrote about the sheet, "By granting its stamp of approval (sorry, couldn't resist), the Postal Service can only broaden modernism's popularity." Goldberger thought the same thing when he was asked by the Citizens' Stamp Advisory Committee for advice. He told the *Washington Post* that the stamps provided an opportunity for "a cultural endorsement."

SHELDON FEATURES AIRSTREAM



The new exhibition at the Sheldon Galleries through Saturday, August 20 is entitled "Airstream!:The Architectural History of the Land Yacht." It traces the innovative design history of the classic streamlined

aluminum travel trailer through plans, models, designs, archival photographs, brochures, video, and material samples from the archives of Airstream Corporation, and from private collections. By the mid-1920s, a shift in interest from the organic forms of Art Nouveau design to the streamlined forms of Art Deco ushered in a new art and design sensibility that celebrated modernity and the machine. The dynamic machine age forms of Art Deco, which were drawn in part from Cubism, became a part of the visual lexicon of modern design. Because of their simplified, angular lines, objects created in the Art Deco style were easy to mass-produce. Soon everyday objects like furniture, clocks, appliances, clothing and cars bore the stamp of this new design aesthetic, which remained popular through the 1930s. It was in this exciting climate that Wallace "Wally" Byam perfected prototypes for his Airstream trailer.

The most important design components of the Airstream were the "monocoque" design -a streamlined form that downplayed wind resistance - and its lightweight aluminum alloy body. Evolving from a simple moveable camping structure to a luxurious "land yacht," by the early 1960s the Airstream had all the modern conveniences of a well appointed home. Electrified and air conditioned, even the earliest trailers of the 1930s advertised "the most advanced heat insulation and ventilation system" of the day. Taking a cue from the aircraft industry, the Airstream was made with a lightweight aluminum alloy, the use of which only war-time rationing interrupted. It was designed so that even "your lovely grandmother could tow it to the middle of the Gobi Desert to live in gracious metropolitan luxury for weeks." The Airstream continues to be one of the most efficient travel trailers on the road today. In recent years, designers have modified interiors to reflect the most contemporary interior design ideas. The interiors of two contemporary designers, Nic Bailey from England and Christopher Deam from San Francisco, are also be featured in the exhibition.





Exhibit: "Airstream!: The Architectural History of the Land Yacht"

The Sheldon Art Galleries, 3648 Washington Ave. Through Saturday, August 20

The history of the Airstream brand of aluminum travel trailer and its evolution as an icon of the Streamline Moderne style are traced in this exhibition. See article in this issue. The Sheldon Galleries are now open Tuesdays and Thursdays noon to 8; Wednesdays and Fridays, noon to 5; Saturdays 10 to 2; and before concert hall events.

Event: Airstream Open House

The Sheldon Galleries, 3648 Washington Ave. Sunday, July 10, 10 a.m. to 4 p.m.

The Sheldon's parking lot will be the setting for a festival of music, dancing, food and Airstream trailer tours, bringing to life the images currently on display in the Bernoudy Gallery at the Sheldon (see above). The Galleries will be open during this event. A detailed schedule of events for the day will be available on the Sheldon's website: <u>www.sheldonconcerthall.org</u>, or phone 314-533-9900.

Event: 7th Annual World's Largest Catsup Bottle Summerfest Birthday Party Main Street, downtown Collinsville, Illinois Sunday, July 10

Once again, Collinsville's 1949 giant Catsup Bottle will be celebrated. Among this year's events will be the Summerfest Classic Car Cruise, Trailnet's bicycle fun club "Big Bottle Ride" and contests to select Little Princess Tomato and Sir Catsup. The full schedule will be posted at <u>www.catsupbottle.com/summerfest</u>, or phone Collinsville Downtown Inc at 618-345-5598.



St. Louis and Missouri Valley Chapters Society of Architectural Historians Post Office Box 23110 St. Louis, Missouri 63108